



**Town of Edgartown**  
Historic District Commission  
Post Office Box 5158  
70 Main Street  
Edgartown, MA 02539

Tel: (508) 627-6155

website: [www.edgartown-ma.us](http://www.edgartown-ma.us)  
email: [HDCr@edgartown-ma.us](mailto:HDCr@edgartown-ma.us)

**Edgartown Historic District Commission**  
**Minutes**  
**January 18, 4:00 PM**

In accordance with Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2022, this meeting will be held through remote conference technology only.

Julia Tarka opened the meeting at 4:00 pm. Members in attendance: Julia Tarka, co-chair, James Cisek, Cari Williamson, Ken Magnuson, Hilary Grannis, Susan Catling.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm. Sharon Brainard read the public hearing notice into record.

**4:00: PH 39 School St (20D-138) Patrick Ahearn/Agent.** 100% demolition of 5' tall green fence and hedge between 30 and 37 School. Construct a new 4' tall privacy fence from the existing Carriage House to the Main House at 39 School St. A new pool and spa to be installed behind the main house at 39 School St. Patrick Ahearn shared on screen the revised plans for the property and discussed the plan. Public comment was opened by Julia Tarka, seeing as there was no public comment the commission deliberated. Ken Magnuson, Susan Catling, James Cisek, Cari Williamson and Julia Tarka have no issues. Hilary Grannis discussed where the revised plan shows the 48" high white picket fence as a pool guard. Patrick stated that it was a mistake and it should be by the porch and the edge of the patio and he could amend and send to the HDC. Julia Tarka said that as long as there were no other issues with the commissioners, we could make a motion with a stipulation and Patrick would send an updated drawing. Ken Magnuson made a Motion to Approve with a Stipulation that the fence for the pool guard goes between the pool patio and the porch seconded by Susan Catling. Unanimous vote by the Board. Peter Rosbeck was absent.

**4:15: 94 North Water (20D-257)** Gregory Mazares/Agent. Replace two doors, no structural changes. Agent shared on screen photos of doors. Ken Magnuson asked if this was visible from a public way and the answer is no. Julia Tarka still wants to give a Certificate of Appropriateness as opposed to non-applicability, as all board members were not able to visit the site. Susan Catling made a Motion to Approve, seconded by James Cisek. Unanimous vote by the Board.

**PH 114 North Water St. (20D-271)** Joe Delory/Agent. To move forward on the property, three (3) options for structure height are proposed, hand crafted Parry wood windows for the façade. Pella wood clad windows for the side and rear. Joe Delory discussed how the height of the building would remain at 16.4' with a two-step front façade. He also viewed photos of the structure. Jordon Hoehn was able to document the measurements. The sidewalk elevation is at 14.75, FF is 16.4, and the average distance from the house to the sidewalk is 11.55'. We took the sidewalk elevation and rounded it to 14.7' and the FFE at 16.4' for a total difference of 20 3/8". Stepping down from the FFE, step down 7" to a brick deck 8' in length, sloping 2" over that total run. Second step is an 8 1/4 rise, finally a slope walkway down to the sidewalk with two steps. Julia Tarka asked for board questions. Ken Magnuson asked if the risers are only 7 1/2 from last meeting. Joe Delory said 7 3/4 from the top of the threshold. The step serves as an egress which is a different code of 7 3/4 max. A stairway changes due to an MA amendment which allows for 8 1/4. Susan Catling asked about the location of the HVAC Unit. The agent said it would be in the rear part of the home, not visible from a public way. Ken Magnuson said we should not have the HVAC Unit location in the approval since it isn't shown on the plan. The public portion was opened again by Julia Tarka. Louise Ambler Olsen spoke about the HVAC Unit and the placement of the unit and if the unit will be screened in and how definitive the renderings are. Julia Tarka said if it was on a plan we would require a screen or move to a non-visible place, if the HVAC is going to be visible, the applicant would have to come back to the HDC which would be the entire left and right side of the building and portions of the back. Joe Delory stated if the HVAC became visible the applicant would be back in front of the HDC. Louise Ambler Olsen was wondering why the HVAC was not shown on the rendering. The public portion was closed and the board deliberated. Ken Magnuson thanked the agent for listening to the HDC and is in favor of Option B and to come back with an HVAC plan. Susan Catling is only in favor of Option A. James Cisek agrees with Option B and to notify the board once the roof is removed and the new framing is set so the commission can see what the house will look like in the condition it should look like. Cari Williamson is in favor of Option B. Hilary Grannis said the agent has done a great job but the house is higher 6" from when it started and to make up for that a window was lowered, so you altered the front façade to make up for the mistake that was made. On the HDC application it states that a foundation requires a certified determination of existing and proposed grade and current and a proposed

height of the building. That wasn't done so I cannot vote in favor of Option B. Julia Tarka stated that this project has been problematic and my issue is the steps. I am okay with Option B since you were able to address the issue with the steps. A Motion to Approve Option B, seconded by James Cisek with the stipulation of the condition which we talked about. Julia Tarka stated that this would include what we discussed at our last meeting as well since this meeting was continued and obviously the HVAC which you will come back for. Julia Tarka, James Cisek, Cari Williamson and Ken Magnuson voted to approve. Opposed were Susan Catling and Hilary Grannis.

**New/Old Business:** The minutes for January 4, 2024 were approved. Cari Williamson made a Motion to Accept the minutes, James Cisek seconded.

**A cut-off date for applicants to hand in any changes or new information for their application is made for the Monday prior to the Historic District Commission meeting including letters from the public.**

Julia Tarka addressed Susan Catling's question about 81 South Water St. and if the application needs to come back to HDC. At the ConCom meeting it was suggested potentially the walkway and patio would not need to come back to the HDC, that is not the case and the applicant has been clear about that and it was not what was communicated to the applicant by Peter Rosbeck. Peter spoke to Kara and cleared up that that was not what he said. If it is visible it will come back to HDC to approve or not, hardscaping is in our purview so we would approve or not. It seems that ConCom is going to require a walkway for that property to access the dock, they don't have ConCom approval yet but that is one of the conditions that is being talked about and it could be visible from a public way and it would be something the HDC would need to look at. This project will come back to us in some capacity.

Hilary Grannis stated that some of the applications are not complete on the grid page and to go over the checklist making sure the application is complete.

James Cisek asked about a bylaw from keeping a house from becoming derelict. Julia Tarka said it's the dilapidated building and Reade Milne is the person in charge of stating a house is dilapidated. James Cisek, someone would notify Reade if they felt a structure was becoming dilapidated. Julia Tarka said there is a fine.

Julia Tarka reminded everyone that she will not be at the February 1<sup>st</sup> meeting but will see everyone mid-February.

A motion to adjourn was made by James Cisek and seconded by Susan Catling.  
Meeting adjourned at 4:45.

Respectfully submitted:  
Sharon Brainard, Administrator

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 01/18/2024  
As voted