

Town of Edgartown

~Historic District

Commission~



Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St.
Edgartown, MA 02539 508 627-6155 ~
HDC@edgartown-ma.us

Zoom Meeting Minutes Thursday, September 7, 2023

In accordance with Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2020, this meeting will be held through remote conference technology only. **Site visits were completed individually.**

Members in attendance: Julia Tarka Co-Chair, Peter Rosbeck Co-Chair, Susan Catling, James Cisek, Cari Williamson, Ken Magnuson, Hilary Grannis, Sharon Brainard Admin.

James Cisek informed the Board that 81 South Water Street is going before the Conservation Commission for approval of a spa pool. Julia Tarka stated this was on her list of announcements as well as the Building Department has issued a cease and desist order on 114 North Water, they demolished more than their permit allowed and are on the agenda for the HDC September 21st meeting to talk about what happened and to plot a plan forward keeping all plans on track with the HDC's approved plans. Also there was a project for 26 School Street and during the changeover between herself and Sharon the application was missed and will be on the agenda for the September 21st meeting.

Julia Tarka called the meeting to order at 4:02 pm.

4:00 46 Pease's Point Way (20D-74) Henry Leel. Replacing 6 over 6 wooden double hung windows. Materials to be used are Anderson 400 or Marvin Integrity SDL double hung 6 over 6. No one showed up for this application. HDC will reach out and see if they still want to go ahead with this application or withdraw. James Cisek has a question about the windows if they were original and could they be repaired especially because they are in the front part of the house. Hilary Grannis has a question if fiberglass windows have ever been approved before. Julia Tarka suggested applicant could bring in an example which has been done in the past. Peter Rosbeck stated that windows usually approved outside of wood have usually been clad, and something of that element and style usually represents some of the historic features but going down in cost of windows, also the design does as well, so to approve something like this a sample

should be showed to the Committee.

Minutes for August 24th meeting were approved. Cari Williamson made a motion to approve and James Cisek seconded the motion. Unanimous vote to approve.

4:15 pm 73 North Water Street (20D-289) Brian Mann. Change to approved plan of a 4' picket fence to a 4' glass fence and locate 3 1/2' frame at the end of the pool facing the harbor. The proposed fence will not be visible from any street and barely visible from the harbor. The fence is approximately 75' from MHW. Materials to be used are glass and stainless supports. Brian Mann shared the proposed location of the glass fence which is on the water side. The only possible view looking onto the property would be from the harbor master's dock which is about 250' away and the purpose of the glass fence is to make it invisible. Letters were read into record against the glass fence. Julia Tarka asked the Committee if they felt this application should go to a public hearing, Peter Rosbeck said yes and had no question, Susan Catling said yes to a public hearing and also that the fence was not appropriate for the historic district. Ken Magnuson said yes to a public hearing and had no further questions. Cari Williamson said yes to a public hearing and states she does not feel it is appropriate for the historic district. Hilary Grannis said yes to a public hearing and had no questions or comments to add. James Cisek said yes to a public hearing and also would much rather see a 4' picket fence than glass and steel which he feels is inappropriate for the historic district. Julia Tarka stated to Brian Mann that he had two choices given what he has heard from board members and the public, the first is to send his request to a public hearing and second to go ahead with what has already been approved and withdraw his application for a glass fence. Brian Mann made the choice to withdraw his application. Applicant also wanted on the record two houses in the historic district where the fence is visible from the street and shared photos with the Committee. A motion was made to accept Brian Mann's withdrawal by Susan Catling and seconded by Ken Magnuson. Unanimous vote by the Committee to accept applicant's withdrawal.

4:10 105 Main Street (20D-65) Guy Grassi. Replace later additions to the original historical house, construct new garage, terraces, porch and greenhouse. Julia Tarka stated that the Committee is familiar with the house and unless other Committee members disagreed the background information of the property would not be discussed, Guy Grassi would start with his new application. New architectural drawings were shared by the applicant and showed its modified from their previous one and has tried to take in all of the concerns the HDC has mentioned. Guy Grassi discussed the site plan and the demolition plan showing the terrace off to the side, the porch, the addition of a one-story wing in the back, proposing to demolish a two section addition on the side, and a little room off to the side. The noticeable differences from the original site plan is the hot tub which has been moved behind the pool, off the property line in the rear, all below ground and within the fenced area. The terrace, the plant screening and the porch are still there. The connector is now a pergola, not a roof.

The proposed first floor plan is the garage, the addition is still the same size, the terrace and living area go down a few steps. Proposing to raise the building to put in a new

foundation and the new foundation will be brick veneered.

The third floor still has the original roof line but the applicant would like to add a skylight on the backside of the slope to bring some additional sunlight. The skylight would be about 5" above the roof line and parallel to the slope and it is also black glass.

The proposed plan is to push the addition back about 5' with a pitched roof to match the main house. The plan still propose to align the window with the front door. Applicant is willing to go with the red cedar shingles across the whole house. The second floor porch is gone. Windows have been added to replace the doors and a single door is to replace the French doors.

The rear elevation is a slightly longer addition, pitched roof with a lower eave line. The fenestration has been slightly altered, windows have been moved so they are on center. A triple window has become a double window.

Julia Tarka is asking any feedback from the Committee. Peter Rosbeck thanked Mr. Grassi for listening to changes the HDC had suggested. He also feels that this application should go to a public hearing and he is in favor of the changes and would support them. Susan Catling agreed to a public hearing and appreciates all the changes the applicant has made. Susan feels the skylight would be visible and not appropriate for the historic district. Susan has questions on the West elevation roof line, triple window with two shed dormers with single windows. The question she has is are the windows set in the gable and the answer is yes, the windows are set back in the gable. Guy Grassi showed different renderings of the project to make design questions easier. Ken Magnuson appreciates the concessions applicant has made for this project and approves of the plan the way it is, but also agrees that this should go to public hearing. Cari Williamson also stated her appreciation of the applicant concessions and does feel this should go to a public hearing. Cari would like assurance the applicant has reached out to groups such as Habitat for Humanity for reuse of materials from demolition. Applicant agrees with Susan. Hilary Grannis appreciates the changes made by applicant and is wondering if the use of a fiberglass window is still going to be used. The answer is yes. Susan is asking for samples and more detail on the window. James Cisek appreciates all the changes applicant has made and is also in favor of a public hearing. Julia Tarka appreciates all the changes made by Guy Grassi and her only concern is the skylight and is looking forward to seeing a mockup and hopefully not a concern. Julia is in favor of a public hearing. Ken Magnuson made a motion to send the application to a public hearing, James Cisek seconded the motion. Motion is unanimous for a public hearing.

Cari Williamson asked about new member(s) joining the HDC, Julia Tarka is hoping to discuss the applicants at the September 21st meeting. The HDC spoke about 114 North Water Street and concerns that the house is getting bigger than before and not being rebuilt as originally planned. James Cisek thought the HDC should contact our legal counsel stating that just recently in Edgartown a small shed was taken down incurring a fine to the homeowners.

Peter Rosbeck motioned to adjourn the meeting and James Cisek seconded the motion.

Respectfully submitted: Sharon Brainard

Approved: _____ Date: _____
As Voted