



EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR. CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT
JOHN W. McCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS BOSTON

100 Morrissey Boulevard
Boston, MA 02125-3393
P: 617.287.4824
F: 617.287.5566
mccormack.umb.edu/centers/cpm
collins.center@umb.edu

December 1, 2020

Mr. James Hagerty
Town Administrator
Town of Edgartown
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Dear Mr. Hagerty:

The Collins Center for Public Management is pleased to submit the following report on the review of the position descriptions and classification of requested positions.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Mary Flanders Aicardi

Mary Flanders Aicardi
HR Practice Leader

REPORT ON THE REVIEW OF SELECTED POSITION DESCRIPTIONS AND CLASSIFICATIONS

INTRODUCTION

In 2016, the Town of Edgartown conducted a town-wide classification and compensation review of all regular full time and part time positions. At that time comprehensive position descriptions were created, and a compensation plan was recommended.

In recent years, some positions have changed and grown resulting in requests for review. In addition, the classification or level of some positions have been viewed as being inaccurate. As a result, the Collins Center was engaged to review the position descriptions and classification of selected positions.

METHODOLOGY

The Human Resources Director distributed review worksheets to employees and supervisors who expressed a wish to have a position reviewed. After receiving the worksheets and supplemental information the Collins Center conducted interviews and a paper review to evaluate the positions, the descriptions and the classification. The positions reviewed include:

Animal Control Officer – Inspector
Assistant Animal Control Officer - Inspector
Assistant Tax Collector
Assistant Town Accountant
Assistant Town Clerk
Assistant Treasurer Collector
Clerk – Tax Collector
Human Resources Director
Library Department Assistant
Special Police Officer
Traffic Officer

DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

After reviewing the duties, responsibilities, accountability and judgment and comparing the level of responsibility of the assistant department heads, it is recommended the positions of Assistant Tax Collector, Assistant Town Accountant, Assistant Town Clerk, and Assistant Treasurer Collector be reclassified from grade D to grade E. The position descriptions have been revised and are provided electronically.

After reviewing the duties, responsibilities, accountability and judgment of the Human Resources Director, it is recommended the position be reclassified from grade I to grade J. The Human Resources position has grown in recent years from being a transactional department with a focus

on personnel files, job descriptions and job postings, to a broader, town-wide, cabinet and strategic planning position. A revised position description has been provided electronically.

After reviewing the duties, responsibilities, accountability and judgment of the Library Department Assistant, and in consideration of the dual responsibility to cover for, and work as, a Library Assistant, it is recommended the position be reclassified from a grade C to a grade D with a change in title from Department Assistant to Administrative and Library Assistant. A revised position description has been provided electronically.

The Collins Center reviewed and updated the position descriptions of the Animal Control Officer/Inspector and Assistant Animal Control Officer/Inspector to include training requirements and the condition of on-call requirements. Issues pertaining to on-call responsibilities and hours work are a pay issue, not a classification or position description issue. It is recommended the Town review the means, methods and policies regarding on-call requirements and compensation. The revised position descriptions have been provided electronically.

The position of Collector Clerk was reviewed for reclassification consideration to the level of a Department Assistant. The department head confirmed the existing position description is accurate. After reviewing the discreet position responsibilities in comparison to the broader, more complex duties of other Department Assistants, including those in the Water, Wastewater, Council on Aging and Harbormaster departments, a change to the level of Department Assistant is not warranted. Instead, it recommended the position be reclassified from a grade A to a grade B due to the level of accountability and experience required, with no change in title.

The Collins Center developed a position description for the positions of Special Police Officer and Traffic Officer, which have been provided electronically.

CLOSING

Thank you for inviting the Collins Center to work with the Town of Edgartown. The Center has also been asked to conduct a salary survey for regular, full time and seasonal positions. The survey will be provided in a report after the collection and analysis of data.

March 3, 2021

Ms. Kim Lucas
Human Resources Director



EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR. CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT
JOHN W. McCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS BOSTON

100 Morrissey Boulevard
Boston, MA 02125-3393
P: 617.287.4824
F: 617.287.5566
mccormack.umb.edu/centers/cpm
collins.center@umb.edu

Town of Edgartown
70 Main Street
Edgartown, MA 02539

Dear Ms. Lucas:

Thank you for allowing the Collins Center for Public Management to assist the Town in conducting a classification and compensation review of all regular and seasonal positions, which was generously funded through a Commonwealth Community Compact grant.

Attached you will find the previously submitted memorandum to the Town Administrator regarding the review of the classification of positions and a recommendation report on the compensation review. Both sets of recommendations dovetail with the Massachusetts Pay Equity Review conducted by the firm of Clifford and Kenny. We appreciated working alongside them for this project.

Please do not hesitate to reach out with any questions.

Sincerely,

Mary Flanders Aicardi

Mary Flanders Aicardi
Human Resources Practice Lead
Collins Center for Public Management



EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR. CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT
JOHN W. McCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS BOSTON

100 Morrissey Boulevard
Boston, MA 02125-3393
P: 617.287.4824
F: 617.287.5566
mccormack.umb.edu/centers/cpm
collins.center@umb.edu

**SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND
RECOMMENDATIONS
FOR THE TOWN OF EDGARTOWN FOR
COMPENSATION PLANS FOR REGULAR AND SEASONAL EMPLOYEES**

MARCH 2021

INTRODUCTION

After receiving a Massachusetts Community Compact Grant, the Town of Edgartown engaged the services of the Collins Center for Public Management. The Collins Center performed a comprehensive compensation and classification plan in 2016 during which position descriptions were created or updated, a classification structure was created, and a compensation plan was recommended after a market salary survey. The Town's By-laws require a periodic review of its classification and compensation plan. As such, the Collins Center reviewed selected classifications of positions that have changed since the last review and recommended warranted changes in descriptions and classification. Additionally, a comprehensive market survey was conducted for all positions, including seasonal positions. The Center also coordinated the work with the firm of Clifford and Kenny in its review of Pay Equity. The market survey results, and analysis of management positions reinforced the findings and recommendations contained within the Pay Equity Review.

METHODOLOGY

The Collins Center obtained the current salary information and list of titles from the Human Resources Director. A salary survey instrument was created and distributed to towns on the island of Martha's Vineyard and the Towns of Falmouth and Mashpee. Completed surveys were received by six of the contacted Towns.

The data was organized into two separate spreadsheets, one for seasonal hourly rates and one for regular full and part time position hourly rates. Hourly rates are used for accurate comparisons across organizations. Some of the survey municipalities work fewer hours. By using hourly rates, the data more accurately reflects the "value" of the position.

SEASONAL RATES

The Town of Edgartown has more than 25 titles on the seasonal compensation plan. Collecting survey data was complicated by this fact in that many municipalities consolidate titles and functions into broader classifications. Additionally, as a larger town on the island, Edgartown has more diverse needs than other towns. The challenge was finding true comparable positions. For example, a Recreation Supervisor in one town may have very different levels of responsibilities or job duties than another. However, trends, minimums and maximums were able to be evaluated, even though many did not have sufficient data points to do an analysis of medians and averages. The following Table reflects the existing classification plan for seasonal positions.

SEASONAL POSITION TITLE	DEPARTMENT	EDGARTOWN GRADE	EDGARTOWN MINIMUM	EDGARTOWN MAXIMUM
Clerk Typist	Various	1	\$12.13	\$14.75
Receptionist	Various	1	\$12.13	\$14.75
Library Clerk	Library	1	\$12.13	\$14.75
Recreation Assistant	Recreation	3	\$13.63	\$16.58
Wharfinger	Harbor	3	\$13.63	\$16.58
Deputy Fish Warden	Harbor	3	\$13.63	\$16.58
Assistant Harbormaster	Harbor	4	\$14.53	\$17.67
Night Watch - Harbor	Harbor	4	\$14.53	\$17.67
Seasonal Laborer	Parks/DPW	4	\$14.53	\$17.67
Park Patrol Officer	Parks	5	\$16.87	\$20.53
Tennis Instructor	Recreation	5	\$16.87	\$20.53
Lifeguard	Beach	6	\$18.13	\$22.06
Seasonal Recreation Supervisor	Recreation	6	\$18.13	\$22.06
Deputy Harbormaster	Harbor	6	\$18.13	\$22.06
Airfield Assistant	Airfield	7	\$19.40	\$23.61
Seasonal DPW Laborer	DPW	7	\$19.40	\$23.61
Head Lifeguard	Beach	8	\$20.77	\$25.26
Beach Director	Beach	8	\$20.77	\$25.26
Park Patrol Director	Park	8	\$20.77	\$25.26
Traffic Control Officer	Police	9	\$18.00	\$21.90
Swim Instructor	Beach	10	\$20.00	\$24.00
Special Officer - Patrol	Police	10	\$20.00	\$24.34
Constable	BOS			\$12.93
Election Registrar	Town Clerk			\$12.93
Election Warden	Town Clerk			\$12.93
Election/Poll Worker	Town Clerk			\$12.01

The Town's seasonal pay rates begin at \$12.01 per hour and end at \$25.26 per hour. In reviewing the collected data, which has been provided electronically, it is clear the Town's starting hourly rate is low. In many instances other Towns have a set rate of pay for positions and not a range of pay.

The Collins Center recommends the Town consolidate the grade structure and adjust the pay ranges to better reflect the market and to improve the Town's ability to recruit and retain seasonal workers. The following Table represents the recommendation.

Action	New Grade	Recommended Hourly Rate(s)
Create a flat rate for Constable, Election and Poll Workers	S-A	\$15.00
Consolidate grades 1, 2 and 3	S-B	\$14.00 - \$17.00
Consolidate grades 4 and 5	S-C	\$16.00 - \$20.00
Adjust Grade 6 rate	S-D	\$18.00 - \$22.00
Adjust Grade 7 rate	S-E	\$19.00 - \$24.00
Consolidate Grades 8 and 9	S-F	\$20.00 - \$26.00
Adjust Grade 10	S-G	\$21.00 - \$27.00

FULL AND PART TIME REGULAR POSITIONS

The Town conducted a comprehensive classification and compensation review in 2016 for regular full time and part time positions. Job descriptions were updated and standardized and a classification and compensation plan was established. The Town Bylaw requires a review of compensation on a periodic basis. As part of the Pay Equity Review and the review of seasonal pay rates, the Town decided to conduct a salary survey for all positions. The following Table represents the FY2021 classification and compensation plan. It should be noted that the Table does reflect the changes recommended in the recent review of the classification of selected positions.

TITLE	GRADE	MINIMUM	MAXIMUM
Highway Superintendent	L	\$45.67	\$60.08
Currently No Titles	K	\$42.47	\$55.89
Facility Manager - Waste Water Harbormaster Human Resources Director IT Manager Shellfish Constable Water Superintendent	J	\$39.52	\$52.00

TITLE	GRADE	MINIMUM	MAXIMUM
Administrator - COA Asst. Water Superintendent Health Agent Inspector of Buildings Library Director Principal Assessor Town Accountant Town Clerk Treasurer	I	\$36.76	\$48.38
Ambulance Coordinator Conservation Agent	H	\$34.20	\$44.98
Chief Operator Director of Senior Services Highway General Foreman	G	\$31.81	\$41.85
ACO/Inspector Board of Health Assistant Cemetery Superintendent Circulation Coordinator Conservation Assistant HEO/Mechanic/Operator Historic District Commission Assistant Operator II Outreach Worker Paramedic Parks Department Administrator Planning Assistant Purchasing Agent Technology & Patron Services Coordinator Young Adult and Youth Services Coordinator Zoning Board of Appeals Assistant	F	\$29.59	\$38.95
Administrative Assistant II Administrative Assistant II Administrative Assistant II Administrative Assistant II HR Assistant Assistant Collector Assistant Town Accountant	E	\$27.52	\$36.19

TITLE	GRADE	MINIMUM	MAXIMUM
Assistant Town Clerk Assistant Treasurer Deputy Harbormaster Deputy Shellfish Warden Library Collection Specialist Operator I Plant Operator Working HEO Foreman			
Administrative Assistant Administrative Asst. to Town Administrator Assistant to the Assessor Data Collector Department/Library Assistant HEO Laborer Library Assistant - Program Coordinator	D	\$25.60	\$33.68
COA Cook Committee Assistant Department Assistant - BOS Department Assistant - Building Department Assistant - COA Department Assistant - Dredge Department Assistant - Harbormaster Department Assistant - Police Department Assistant - Waste Water Department Assistant - Water Library Assistant	C	\$23.82	\$31.34
Clerk - Collector Junior Operator Junior Operator	B	\$22.15	\$29.15
Clerk - Finance Committee Clerk - Planning Custodian	A	\$20.61	\$27.11

The complete survey has been provided electronically. The analysis of the survey data revealed that the Town's managerial positions have fallen behind the labor market, which coincides with some of the

findings of the Pay Equity Act review conducted prior to the salary review. The follow Table shows the summary analysis of the maximum pay rates for the survey positions.

TITLE	GRADE	EDGARTOWN MAXIMUM	SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM	EDGARTOWN MINUS AVE MAXIMUM	EDGARTOWN MINUS MED MAXIMUM
Highway Superintendent	L	\$60.08	\$50.95	\$49.65	\$9.13	\$10.43
Facility Manager - Waste Water	J	\$52.00	\$51.58	\$51.29	\$0.42	\$0.71
Harbormaster	J	\$52.00	\$45.79	\$46.06	\$6.21	\$5.94
Human Resources Director	J	\$52.00	\$50.32	\$50.52	\$1.68	\$1.48
IT Manager	J	\$52.00	\$52.54	\$52.05	(\$0.54)	(\$0.05)
Shellfish Constable	J	\$52.00	\$42.48	\$41.50	\$9.52	\$10.50
Water Superintendent	J	\$52.00				
Administrator - COA	I	\$48.38	\$48.00	\$49.55	\$0.38	(\$1.17)
Asst. Water Superintendent	I	\$48.38				
Health Agent	I	\$48.38	\$48.13	\$51.29	\$0.25	(\$2.90)
Inspector of Buildings	I	\$48.38	\$50.54	\$51.29	(\$2.16)	(\$2.90)
Library Director	I	\$48.38	\$50.27	\$51.22	(\$1.88)	(\$2.84)
Principal Assessor	I	\$48.38	\$49.18	\$50.83	(\$0.80)	(\$2.45)
Town Accountant	I	\$48.38	\$51.00	\$51.22	(\$2.62)	(\$2.84)
Town Clerk	I	\$48.38	\$47.97	\$48.73	\$0.41	(\$0.34)
Treasurer	I	\$48.38	\$52.60	\$51.22	(\$4.22)	(\$2.84)
Ambulance Coordinator	H	\$44.98				
Conservation Agent	H	\$44.98	\$49.31	\$49.47	(\$4.33)	(\$4.49)
Chief Operator	G	\$41.85	\$44.03	\$44.07	(\$2.18)	(\$2.22)
Director of Senior Services	G	\$41.85	\$39.82	\$43.45	\$2.03	(\$1.60)
Highway General Foreman	G	\$41.85	\$41.26	\$39.40	\$0.59	\$2.45
ACO/Inspector	F	\$38.95	\$35.81	\$31.71	\$3.14	\$7.25
Board of Health Assistant	F	\$38.95	\$34.41	\$32.63	\$4.54	\$6.32
Cemetery Superintendent	F	\$38.95				
Circulation Coordinator	F	\$38.95	\$32.61	\$32.99	\$6.34	\$5.97

TITLE	GRADE	EDGARTOWN MAXIMUM	SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM	EDGARTOWN MINUS AVE MAXIMUM	EDGARTOWN MINUS MED MAXIMUM
Conservation Assistant	F	\$38.95				
HEO/Mechanic/Operator	F	\$38.95				
Historic District Commission Assistant	F	\$38.95				
Operator II	F	\$38.95				
Outreach Worker	F	\$38.95	\$35.36	\$35.67	\$3.59	\$3.28
Paramedic	F	\$38.95	\$38.49	\$39.03	\$0.46	(\$0.08)
Parks Department Administrator	F	\$38.95	\$44.66	\$47.80	(\$5.71)	(\$8.85)
Planning Assistant	F	\$38.95	\$42.27	\$42.67	(\$3.32)	(\$3.72)
Purchasing Agent	F	\$38.95				
Technology & Patron Services Coordinator	F	\$38.95	\$36.23	\$35.92	\$2.72	\$3.03
Young Adult and Youth Services Coordinator	F	\$38.95	\$36.05	\$35.92	\$2.90	\$3.03
Zoning Board of Appeals Assistant	F	\$38.95	\$42.67	\$44.72	(\$3.72)	(\$5.77)
Administrative Assistant II	E	\$36.19				
Administrative Assistant II	E	\$36.19				
Administrative Assistant II	E	\$36.19	\$31.07	\$30.10	\$5.12	\$6.09
Administrative Assistant II	E	\$36.19				
Assistant Collector	E	\$36.19	\$39.75	\$35.81	(\$3.56)	\$0.38
Assistant Town Accountant	E	\$36.19				
Assistant Town Clerk	E	\$36.19	\$32.10	\$30.57	\$4.09	\$5.62
Assistant Treasurer	E	\$36.19				
Deputy Harbormaster	E	\$36.19				
Deputy Shellfish Warden	E	\$36.19	\$33.18	\$32.64	\$3.01	\$3.55
Library Collection Specialist	E	\$36.19				
Operator I	E	\$36.19				
Plant Operator	E	\$36.19	\$36.00	\$35.67	\$0.19	\$0.52
Working HEO Foreman	E	\$36.19				
Administrative Assistant	D	\$33.68				
Administrative Assistant to the Town Administrator	D	\$33.68	\$38.04	\$36.54	(\$4.36)	(\$2.86)
Assistant to the Assessor	D	\$33.68				

TITLE	GRADE	EDGARTOWN MAXIMUM	SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM	EDGARTOWN MINUS AVE MAXIMUM	EDGARTOWN MINUS MED MAXIMUM
Data Collector	D	\$33.68	\$33.18	\$32.82	\$0.50	\$0.86
Department/Library Assistant	D	\$33.68				
HEO Laborer	D	\$33.68	\$26.38	\$25.86	\$7.30	\$7.82
Library Assistant - Program Coordinator	D	\$33.68	\$30.95	\$30.10	\$2.73	\$3.58
COA Cook	C	\$31.34				
Committee Assistant	C	\$31.34	\$38.48	\$41.64	(\$7.14)	(\$10.30)
Department Assistant - BOS	C	\$31.34				
Department Assistant - Building	C	\$31.34	\$33.11	\$33.31	(\$1.77)	(\$1.97)
Department Assistant - COA	C	\$31.34				
Department Assistant - Dredge	C	\$31.34				
Department Assistant - Harbormaster	C	\$31.34				
Department Assistant - Police	C	\$31.34				
Department Assistant - Waste Water	C	\$31.34				
Department Assistant - Water	C	\$31.34				
Library Assistant	C	\$31.34	\$22.57	\$23.81	\$8.77	\$7.54
Clerk - Collector	B	\$29.15				
Junior Operator	B	\$29.15				
Junior Operator	B	\$29.15				
Clerk - Finance Cte	A	\$27.11				
Clerk - Planning	A	\$27.11				
Custodian	A	\$27.11	\$25.82	\$26.87	\$1.29	\$0.24

Of particular concern is the group of positions in the "I" level. Table 5 (attached) reflects the rates of pay of the survey towns versus that of Edgartown. The Table shows that in every title in the grade, Edgartown's rate of pay is below that of the market. While a dollar rate may not appear to be a large difference, when annualized it can be significant.

When the current classification plan was created, no positions were placed in Grade K. After reviewing the salary survey data and coalescing the information contained in the Pay Equity Review, the Collins Center recommends the following adjustments to the existing structure.

- Move the positions in Grade J to Grade K
- Move the positions in Grade I to Grade J
- Move the positions in Grade H to Grade I

It is recommended that the individuals holding the positions in the above mentioned grades, be placed in the new grade, effective July 1, 2021 at the rate that causes them an increase. If an across the board increase is given, the placement on the scale should be based upon the adjusted pay.

CLOSING

The Collins Center thanks the Town of Edgartown for allowing us to work on this project and would like to especially thank Ms. Lucas for her assistance.

**TABLE 5 – GRADE I SURVEY RESULTS TO ILLUSTRATE THE MARKET DIFFERENCES FOR THE
MANAGERIAL POSITIONS**

GRADE I	COA Administrator	Asst. Water Superintendent	Health Agent	Inspector of Buildings	Library Director	Principal Assessor	To Accou
EDGARTOWN MAXIMUM	\$48.38	\$48.38	\$48.38	\$48.38	\$48.38	\$48.38	\$48.38
AQUINNAH MAXIMUM	\$57.10	NA	NA	\$49.65	\$43.15	\$43.15	\$43.15
CHILMARK MAXIMUM			\$37.38	\$46.06	\$51.14	\$51.14	\$51.14
FALMOUTH MAXIMUM	N/A	N/A	\$50.52	\$50.52	\$54.29	\$50.52	\$50.52
OAK BLUFFS MAXIMUM	\$51.29			\$52.40	\$51.29	\$51.29	\$51.29
TISBURY MAXIMUM	\$35.81		\$52.05	\$52.05	\$49.15	\$41.09	\$52.05
WEST TISBURY MAXIMUM	\$47.80		\$52.57	\$52.57	\$52.57	\$57.86	\$52.57
SURVEY AVERAGE MAXIMUM	\$48.00		\$48.13	\$50.54	\$50.27	\$49.18	\$51.29
SURVEY MEDIAN MAXIMUM	\$49.55		\$51.29	\$51.29	\$51.22	\$50.83	\$51.29
EDGARTOWN MINUS AVERAGE MAXIMUM	\$0.38		\$0.25	(\$2.16)	(\$1.88)	(\$0.80)	(\$2.16)
EDGARTOWN MINUS MEDIAN MAXIMUM	(\$1.17)		(\$2.90)	(\$2.90)	(\$2.84)	(\$2.45)	(\$2.90)