

# Town of Edgartown

## ~Historic District Commission~

Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St. Edgartown, MA 02539

508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us

## Historic District Commission

### Minutes of Zoom Meeting

Thursday, July 15, 2021



In accordance with Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2021, this meeting will be held through remote conference technology.

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott, Susan Catling, Carole Berger, Cari Williamson, Julia Tarka & James Cisek (A). Absent: Peter Rosbeck & Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber & Doug Finn-Host.

**4:00 - Lucy Morrison, MVC.** Lucy Introduced Christina Mankowski. Ms. Mankowski explained that she is planning a meeting with all Island Historic Districts to discuss DRI regarding explanations for historic structures outside the defined Local Historic Districts, and referrals to the MV Commission. In reference to structures over 100 years that are not within the jurisdiction of the Local Historic District, any application for full or partial demolition will be automatically referred to the MVC for review. The referral is generally made by the Building Inspector but may be made by any Board or Commission. Once a referral is received, the MVC may reach out to the local Historic Districts for an opinion as to the historical significance of the structure. The Edgartown Historic District Commission will not be the deciding body for any such application as it is outside the jurisdiction of the HDC. The knowledge of the local HDCs is one of the tools used by the MVC to gather information to help with any determination by the MV Commission. Ms. Mankowski will continue to invite the members of HD's to site visits and seek knowledge the HD's may have to offer. Chris Scott noted that the referral, for structures over 100 years in age, is mandatory not discretionary. Christina reiterated that yes, such a referral is mandatory. Lucy noted that there are two types of reviews: Concurrence and full DRI review. The inclusion of any opinion from any HD may be helpful when the type of review is decided by the MVC. The Edgartown HDC may be advisory in the process but not regulatory.

**4:05 - 96 Main St. (20D-59)** Allison & William Wolf. Joshua Gothard/agent. Applicant proposes to remove existing garage and construct a new one car garage with 400 sq. ft. detached bedroom above. Joshua made the presentation, displayed plans and photos were reviewed and explained. He noted that the South elevation would be viewed from Pent Lane and the North elevation would be viewed from Main St.  
Member Questions: Chris noted that this is the first review of the plans which will result in a determination or a referral to public hearing. It was noted that this is a demolition of the garage. Cari Williamson expressed her view that this application should be reviewed in a Public Hearing, and the history should be further reviewed. Joshua said that the existing garage may be relocated to act as a garden shed. Susan Catling expressed need for

a Public hearing as did James Cisek, Carole Berger, Christopher Scott and Julia Tarka. Joshua said that the plans for the main house will not change, just the garage

Q: Susan noted a concern about the size of dormers that appear very heavy for such a small building. A: To make the ridge as low as possible dormers are needed. Motion to send to public hearing on 8.19.21 Julia Tarka, Cari Williamson 2<sup>nd</sup>. Unanimously approved to send to Public Hearing. .

**4:20 - 114 N. Water St. (20C-271)** Michael Hegarty. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes to remove existing one car garage, remove side porch, and construct new 2 car garage at rear of the house, new cabana & pool, new side addition to existing rear ell, add new decorative rail above existing front porch. Mr. Ahearn made the presentation. Plans and photos were displayed. The house is a Greek revival dating from 1845 or 1875. It currently has vinyl siding and asphalt roof. Minor changes include new windows & a red cedar roof. All vinyl and aluminum storm doors to go along with the aluminum siding. Primary façade change includes the upper rail detail and detail of porch columns. There is a secondary side door with porch above and proposed rear porch. They will remove the hip roof on rear of ell with addition of a porch. Window replaced with a French door on upper level. Existing screened porch to be modified as a one story addition with door. Mr. Ahearn noted that the existing one car garage not as old as house, but is old. They plan to remove the existing garage and build a new garage in the rear along with a new pool and pool cabana. There is no change planned for existing guest cottage other than a new red cedar roof and wood siding to replace white vinyl siding. The current brick drive way will continue back to the new garage. Photos were displayed. The plans include a 4 ft. green wood fence at garage for pool compliance and other fencing will be wire hidden inside of the foliage.

Member comments: Cari noted that refurbishing the new materials is prudent and great, needed maintenance. Pool cabana house will be visible. Susan noted this as a good upgrade but is concerned about the front façade. Described as Greek Revival and dated 1840-1850 with Italianate details added in 1875 per the National Register nomination form, the house does not reflect Italianate but has probably been added to over time. She noted that the proposed French doors may not be too accurate for the time. Patrick offered a discussion to refurbish the front doors as shown in the photo, from the interior. Further it was noted that the railing proposed on the front façade, does not show in the photo from 1902. Patrick agreed and offered to eliminate the front railing from the plans. James Cisek agreed with Susan about the front of the house and the 'old doors' and the railing but noted the plans as an overall improvement. Carole Berger concurred that the railing, while attractive, was likely not original adornment to this house. Motion to send to public hearing on 8.19.21, Susan Catling. 2<sup>nd</sup> Christopher Scott. Approved to move to public hearing with 2 times for site visits on Wednesday 8.18. 21. 10AM and 6PM. Mr. Ahearn will be on site with plans and the buildings will be marked on the ground.

### **New/Old Business:**

There will be a Public Hearing/Kelley House August 12, 2021, with 2 site visits on August 9, 2021 at 10AM and 6PM.

It was brought to the attention of the members that there is Purple flood lighting on North Water St. at Mad Marthas. Day time and night time showing the purple flood lighting, were shown. Members requested that a letter be sent to the management/owners explaining that the lighting has not been approved and requesting that the purple lights be turned off immediately.

**Minutes 6.24.21** Motion to approve: Susan Catling. 2<sup>nd</sup> Cari Williamson. Unanimously approved.

**Minutes 7.1.21** Motion to approve: Susan Catling. 2<sup>nd</sup> Cari Williamson. Unanimously approved.

**Adjourned: 5:01**

Respectfully submitted:

Bricque Garber, assistant

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ 8.5.21  
As voted