

Town of Edgartown
~Historic District Commission~

Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St. Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us



Historic District Commission
Zoom Meeting Minutes
Thursday, December 17, 2020

In accordance with Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2020, this meeting will be through remote conference technology only.

Members in attendance: Christopher Scott, Susan Catling, Julia Tarka, Cari Williamson, Carole Berger, Peter Rosbeck & Ken Magnuson. Staff: Bricque Garber & Doug Finn-Host.

The Public Hearing advertised for 4:00 has been withdrawn by the applicant.

Christopher Scott called the meeting to order at 4:02 PM. Given the time lag due to the withdrawal of the 4:00 Public Hearing, the **Minutes of 12.3.2020** were voted. Motion to approve the minutes, Susan Catling. 2nd, Cari Williamson. Unanimously Approved.

Carole Berger was voted by the Commissioners to move from her current position as alternate to full member of the Commission, filling the vacancy left by Molly Costello.

37 Main St. (20D-206) North Water Street Corp. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes new egress stair and door on the West side and install 6' wood fence at east side yard. This application was taken out of order, given time availability, due to the withdrawal of the 1st application.

Patrick Ahearn appeared and described the project as proposed. He noted that the upper floor apartment has egress through the lower commercial space. He said the new egress stair to correct this issue and provide fire separation. The plan also calls to convert a window to a door and add a small section fence to obscure the look into the garbage area. Mr. Ahearn said that there is presently no fire separation between the residential and commercial space and the mixed use in one building requires a fire separation.

Chris Scott noted a fence as a good idea to screen the alley, but he does not see the need for the extra stair. Patrick said that the tenant has to enter the apartment through retail space. Chris countered that the entry is a vestibule (shared entry) not accessed by going through a retail space. Mr. Ahearn said that they are trying to gain reasonable separation and use and create fire separation. It was noted that a common front door provides access to shoe store and Past & Presents. Chris said this is a 1776 building and sees any addition as very sensitive. Susan Catling asked if the current situation violates code or do they simply want to come into the building on the side rather than the vestibule. Susan said she sees this as a substantial change to the very old building, Carole Berger agreed. Julia Tarka noted concerns regarding the proposed 6' fence. Mr. Ahearn noted they propose only just section of fence

Which wood obscure the trash area from Main St. Carole Berger noted that the alley is an eyesore, and doing something to cure the eye sore is a good idea. Julia discussed the existing white picket fence. Patrick said that the section of fence at Main St. and the gate at the rear will take care of the trash problem. Peter asked about further applicant direction for the trash area. Julia noted no objection to the fence on Main St. Patrick said the fence will tidy-up the streetscape and would be placed a foot back from the front of the buildings and could be 5 rather than 6 feet in height. Chris Scott moved to send the application to a Public Hearing with a site visit. Julia Tarka provided a 2nd. Unanimously approved to go to PH on 1.7.21.

Public Hearing: 132 S. Water St. (29B-25) Robert & Susan van Roijen. Carlos Ribera, Brooks & Falotico/agents. Applicant proposes to add a screened porch and rear entry over existing deck and add a bay window. Chairman Scott asked if there were any members of the public at the hearing. There was no response. And there were no letters submitted for consideration. Louise Brooks from Brooks & Falotico made the presentation. It was noted that the house was in the early 2000's. This plan calls to add a screened porch over the existing deck and add back door and bay window. All work and materials will be done to match existing renovations. There was a limited discussion and it was noted that very little is visible from the public way. The applicant will be reusing existing windows. The Public Hearing was opened and closed as there were no members of the public on this zoom call and there is no public correspondence. Members commented: Cari Williamson sees this modification as in sync with this addition.. Susan Catling sees the change as appropriate to the house. Carole, Peter, Julia and Chris were in agreement. Motion to approve Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Susan Catling. Unanimously Approved.

Public Hearing: 21 Planting Field Way (20F-36.2) GSC Realty Trust. Guy Grassi/agent. Applicant proposes to demo 20 year old addition to create a conforming guest house. Guy Grassi asked the host to display the drawings and described the plans. He noted that HDC had already approved a new 2 story house on this lot.

At the rear of the very historic house is an addition added 20-30 years ago. The goal of this project is convert the existing historic structure to a 900 sq. ft. guest house. To accomplish this they will remove the non-historic addition and lift the old house and construct a new foundation. After the addition is removed the old house will undergo restoration as needed noting that the old house is in very poor condition. A small blue stone patio will be added in the rear but is not visible from any public way. The plan includes restoring the chimneys which may have to be taken down and rebuilt when the building is lifted for a new foundation. The shed dormer will be replaced with smaller shed dormer. Front door will be saved, if possible or replaced with a very similar door.

The Cabana, shown on the last page of the plans, will be discussed and voted at the next meeting on January 7, 2021. The cabana will not be sent forward for an advertised public hearing but the abutters will be notified. Questions from the members: Chris Scott noted that he lived next door to this property for 25 years. He noted explained that the existing house is one of the oldest in the village

but the additions are not historic and are approx 30 yrs. old. Mr. Scott noted the poor condition of the old house but feels this plan goes a long way toward preserving the old house, and he sees no loss of history here. The Cabana as drawn will be heard at the next meeting as it was not called out in the public hearing notices.

Carole Berger agreed with Christopher Scott. She noted the house likely dates from the 1700's. Paul Pertile said that there is an interior closet door that has 1780 on the door. Chris and Carole noted hardware is consistent with 1780's. It was noted that Bill Bishop built the addition approx. 32 years ago. There was discussion regarding the history of the building and it was noted that there is lovely interior detail in the old house i.e. 'gun stock' posts.

Carole began a discussion about the windows. Mr. Grassi does not think that the windows are salvageable. Paul Pertile noted that they have been 'piecemealing' the house for years and the windows are in poor shape. Chris opened Public Hearing. There were no members of the public to speak to the application and there were no letters received. Mr. Scott closed the Public Hearing.

Comments from the members: Susan Catling deferred to Carole Berger and Chris Scott who have ample knowledge of the house. It was explained that in previous renovations of old homes, any original windows were saved and rebuilt, if necessary, and used to replace the first floor windows on the front and possibly sides of the house. Carole noted that the charm is in the history and this house is 240 years old. Peter asked if any of the glass is original. A: Not sure. Q: If there is old glass, would the applicant take the old glass to make custom windows for the first floor? There was a discussion regarding interior storm windows. Susan agreed that keeping the old glass windows in the front would be important. Mr. Grassi agreed that any old glass will be used in building custom windows for the first floor. Discussion regarding windows ensued.

Peter Rosbeck made a motion to approve the demolition of the 32 year old addition and the restoration of the historic house with restored old glass custom windows to be rebuilt for the front and North side of the first floor. 2nd, Cari Williamson. Unanimously approved. The Cabana, shown on the last page of the plans, will be discussed and voted at the next meeting on January 7, 2021. The cabana will not be sent forward for an advertised public hearing but the abutters will be notified.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:30 PM

*Respectfully submitted:
Bricque Garber, Assistant*

Approved: _____ 1.7.2021