

Town of Edgartown
~Historic District Commission~
Post Office Box 5158 ~ 70 Main St. Edgartown, MA 02539
508 627-6155 ~ HDC@edgartown-ma.us



Historic District Commission
Zoom Meeting Minutes
Thursday, December 3, 2020

In accordance with Chapter 53 of the Acts of 2020, this meeting will be through remote conference technology only.

Members in attendance: Chris Scott, Susan Catling, Carole Berger, Cari Williamson, Julia Tarka, Ken Magnuson and Peter Rosbeck. Staff: Doug Finn & Bricque Garber

Mr. Scott reviewed Public Hearing procedures.

Public Hearing: 127 South Water St. (new lot) Tina Kohnen. Patrick Ahearn/agent. Applicant proposes new home on open lot. Mr. Ahearn discussed the property and the plans which were shown on the screen. The new construction will take place on the current lot that will be divided pending approval of the Edgartown Planning Board. A new curb cut will be added, as well. Mr. Ahearn described the new lot as “virtually hidden” as seen from South Water St. The current house will be used by the family and the new house to be used by the owner. This will create a multi-generational property.

The new 3 bedroom, Greek revival, farm house will be 2240 sq. ft. and have a wrap-around deck. The free standing carriage house will be accessed from Atwood and have a two car garage and 2 bedrooms on the 2nd floor. The carriage house will be built as an accessory structure to the existing house. All existing vegetation will remain.

Q: Building heights? A: 24 ft. = 1&1/2 story. Q: Given the slope of the site will the house sit lower? A: Yes, but little change to the yard.

Mr. Scott opened the Public Hearing: There were no comments from the public. Two letters were read from Mike Long & Jon and Susie Lindenberg. Both letters were supportive of the project. Public Hearing was closed.

Member comments were positive. Cari noted that the farm house style fits nicely. Julia agreed but noted it's a lot of buildings for the property. Mr. Ahearn noted that the new lot

will be 3 times the minimum lot size. Members agreed that there will be little visibility from S. Water St. Motion to approve, as presented: Susan Catling, 2nd, Carole Berger. Voted to approve with Julia Tarka voting nay.

4:20 - Public Hearing: 10 & 14 Pent Lane (20D-51.1 & 46.2) Edward Doherty. Gerrett Conover & Sasha Robinson White/agents. Applicant proposes to demolish existing house and replace with garage/carriage house with pass through. Extend existing covered terrace and wrap around the corner of the house. Mr. Robinson-White made the presentation and noted that this lot is the result of lots being merged as was approved by the Edgartown Planning Board. The existing house will be demolished in favor of a new
HDC Minutes page 2 of 3

carriage house including an 895 sq. ft. guest house with 3 car garage. This change will help to better address the expanded lot. The existing house sits 4 ft. back from Pent Lane and the new structure will be 22 ft. back from the lane. The gable does not face the street. The house to be demolished dates from the 1940's but was remodeled significantly in 1991.

Mr. Scott opened the Public Hearing: John Tankard (Architect- Abutter) noted an objection to the roof pitch. He said it is not traditional and looks more of a grand entrance. Mr. Tankard provided a letter outlining his concerns and possible remedies. He would like to see a reduction in the roof pitch and wings from 12/12 to 10/12 as is more common in Greek revival 1 1/2 story houses. 12/12 pitch is much too strong and the roof pitch at #14 & #18 Pent Lane, are approximately 7/12. He further asked that the dormer pitches are reduced to make them less prominent, and lighten the over scaled details of the eaves and rakes.

Mary Ellen Croteau (Architect- Abutter) said that she generally supports the project but is concerned about the height of the new construction scale as relates to the abutters house. She noted that she would like to see the height of the carriage house be lowered to match the existing lower gable height at the back of 10 Pent Lane, 2-3' lower than what is proposed. She noted concerned that if the height of the pitch is lowered, the height of the eave might be height and she is opposed to an increase in the eave height.

There was discussion regarding the objections and further descriptions of the proposed fencing. It was noted that the pass-through is not for vehicles and is a walk way, only. Sasha Robinson-White and Gerrett Conover said that the can and will lower the pitches and gables and eaves. Mr. Dyroff (Abutter) asked questions concerning the construction site management including vehicle parking and the construction dates. Mr. Conover said that the trucks can be parked on the site and 2 on the street. There will be no exterior from June 1 – August.

After discussion and Mr. Robinson-White's promise to provide updated drawings to illustrate the changes, a motion was made by Cari Williamson to approve the project conditioned on the modifications as discussed and administrative review of the new drawings. Julia provided the 2nd. Approved, unanimously.

Public Hearing: 52 Fuller St. (20B-95) Al Hamood. Gerrett Conover & Sasha Robinson White/agents. Applicant proposes to enlarge an existing screened porch and use glass doors to create a 4 season room opening on the pool terrace. Roof deck will be expanded to cover expanded porch. Add a pool bath & small laundry room to existing pool cabana. Add an outdoor grill/eating area with roof to match existing. Mr. Robinson-White

made the presentation and noted that there will not be a laundry as was drawn. The 1/2 bath will service the pool. It was noted, by Mr. Scott, that there is only a minimum of exposure from the public way. No questions from the Commission members. Motion to approve Ken Magnuson. 2nd, Julia Tarka. Unanimously approved.

Public Hearing: 28 S. Summer (20D-134) Gerrett Conover. Applicant proposes to build annex structure in rear, add picket fencing in front, add cobblestone pavement on entry and driveway and add a gas lamp post. Julia Tarka was recused from hearing this

HDC Minutes page 3 of 3

application. The project was presented by Louis Lisboa of VLA Architects. It was explained that there was a small building in the rear of the lot which was removed at the time of the original plan for the modifications. The owner now wants to add an auxiliary building in the left rear of the back yard. The visibility of the building will be minimal. The 6 ft. fence being added is a small section with will block the view of the condensers. The picket fence and gate are more decorative than a standard white picket and were modeled after other fencing in the village. The fencing was discussed. The location of the new gas lantern was illustrated on the plans. The Public Hearing was opened and closed there being no public comment or letters. The members asked a few more questions about the fencing but there was no objection noted. Motion to approve as presented, Cari Williamson. 2nd, Chris Scott. Unanimously approved.

Public Hearing: 27 & 33 S. Summer St. (20D-186,183) Gerrett Conover/Charlotte Inn. Gerrett Conover & Sasha Robinson White/agents. Applicant proposes to replace existing cast iron fence with similar fence. Julia Tarka was recused. Mr. Robinson white presented the plan for the replacement of the current cast iron fencing. A drawing of the proposed fence was viewed and it was noted that it is more decorative but is more consistent with the time the building was erected. Chris Scott noted that the Victorian elements are appropriate to the style of the building. The Public Hearing was opened but there were no public comment or letters. Members voiced no concerns and agreed that the proposed fence is lovely and appropriate. Motion to approve Peter Rosbeck. 2nd, Ken Magnuson. Approved, unanimously.

New / Old Business: The last 2020 meeting will be on December 17th.

Minutes: 11/19/20

Motion to approve Susan Catling. Carole Berger, 2nd. Unanimously Approved.

Respectfully submitted:
Bricque Garber, Assistant

Approved as voted: _____ 12.17.2020