

Case No. 11-20
Date Filed: 2 June 2020

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

I, Lisa C. Morrison, assistant to the Zoning Board of Appeals of the town of Edgartown, hereby certify that the following is a detailed record of proceedings pertaining to the request of Robert & Charlene La Roche for a special permit under section 10.1 G of the bylaw to construct additions to an existing residence including a single-story addition at the rear of the property and a two-story garage with an exercise room and storage above – all on a preexisting, nonconforming lot located at 53 Saddle Club Road, Assr. Pcl. 22-1.238) in the R-60 Residential District.

1. On 2 June 2020 the application, a true copy of which is marked "A," was presented to the Town Clerk.
2. In addition, an advertisement, a true copy of which is marked "B," was published in the Vineyard Gazette on 5 June and 12 June 2020.
3. Notice of the hearing, a copy of which is marked "C," was mailed, postage prepaid, to the petitioners; the abutters - owners of land adjacent to the subject property within 300 feet of the property lines - all as they appear on the most recent, applicable, certified tax list; and to all the proper town boards and departments.

On Wednesday, 24 June 2020 the hearing was continued to 30 June 2020 because the board consisted of only four members and the applicant wished to proceed with a five-member board. The board reconvened on 30 June 2020 at 3:00 p.m. The public hearing was held remotely via Zoom. The following board members were sitting for this hearing: Martin Tomassian – Chairman, Carol Grant, Nancy Whipple, Pam Dolby, and Robin Bray– alternate. Chairman Tomassian introduced the board members and read the necessary requirements for conducting remote meetings in order to comply with both the Governor's order and the Open Meeting Law.

Doug Best, contractor, made the presentation for M/M La Roche, who were also present. Mr. Best explained that the La Roches had owned the property since 1991 and they are looking to retire. They would like to expand the footprint of the existing 1500 sq. ft. house by about 750 sq. ft. and construct an attached two-car, two-story garage with storage and an exercise room above. The ridge line of the garage will mirror that of the house. There will be a basement put in under the addition to house mechanical equipment. The existing house has no basement, hence the need for additional storage above the garage.

Best noted that there will be no change in the number of bedrooms

Mr. Tomassian asked if there were any letters from town boards or departments. There were none. A letter from abutter Ralph Peckham of 49 Saddle Club Road was read. Mr. Peckham lives directly to the left of the La Roche property and he was concerned that the natural buffer between the two properties remain, especially as the rather large garage would be visible from his kitchen windows.

A letter in favor of the project from Marshall & Poppy Milner of 55 Saddle Club Road was also read. The Milners are direct abutters on the right side of the property.

Another abutter, Keith Gregorian-Michaelsen of 56 Saddle Club Road (directly across from the Milners) was present for the Zoom session and asked if the garage would have an exterior stairway. Best replied that it would not; the only access to the second floor of the garage would be internal.

Addressing Mr. Peckham's concerns, Best said that the applicants intend to keep as much of the buffer between the Peckham and the La Roche property as possible and, if necessary to preserve privacy, add additional plantings.

Tomassian then closed the public portion of the hearing for discussion by the board. Ms. Grant asked if the ridge height of the garage was higher than that of the main house. Best replied that it was approximately 6-inches higher. Bray asked if it could be reduced somewhat. Best said that in order to accommodate both a two-car garage, exercise equipment, and tie-in to the roof line of the house in an acceptable manner, the height was needed.

Dolby asked why the dormer was necessary, if the second floor was not going to be used as habitable space. Best replied that it was needed for head space for the exercise room. He noted that the La Roches may wish to change the use of the space in the future.

Grant asked if there should be a condition on the permit that the applicant would need to return to the board should they wish to convert the area to habitable space. She also stipulated that no plumbing be added to the space without prior approval from the board.

Bray asked why the laundry room was relocated to the garage. Best replied that it is not in the garage, but in a breezeway. The laundry had previously been in a bathroom and the reason for relocating it is so that M/M La Roche could essentially live on one floor.

Whipple said she had no additional concerns and commented that she had visited the site and believes that the renovated house will be compatible with the neighborhood. She said she saw many similar structures with both attached and detached garages in the neighborhood.

Ms. Whipple then made a motion to approve the project as presented saying she found the project to be in harmony with the general purpose and intent of the bylaw. She noted that there was approval from two of the abutters, and she believed that the concerns of the other abutter had been adequately addressed. She proposed that three conditions be placed on the permit: (1) Area above the garage will not be converted to habitable space without

prior approval from the board; (2) no plumbing is to be installed on the second floor of the garage without prior approval from the board; (3) the vegetative buffer between the garage and the neighbor's property is to be maintained and added to - if necessary - to ensure a reasonable amount of privacy between the two lots.

Ms. Dolby seconded the motion and voted to approve the project for the same reasons and with the same conditions.

Ms. Grant, Ms. Bray, and Mr. Tomassian also voted to grant the special permit for the same reasons. Unanimously approved 5 to 0.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa C. Morrison, Assistant